BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03350 9969

SENTENCING AND PENAL POLICY
(Volume 1)

Prepared By

Gary T. Trotter

Spring 1993

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

DEC -1 1992

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

SENTENCING AND PENAL POLICY
(Volume 1)

Prepared By

Gary T. Trotter

Spring 1993

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/sentencingpenalp01trot_0

SENTENCING AND PENAL POLICY

Volume 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. The Philosophical Dimensions of Sentencing 1

(a) Introduction: The Debate 1

David Garland, Punishment and Modern Society: A Study in Social Theory (1990) 1

R.A. Duff, Trials and Punishments (1986) 4

H.L.A. Hart, "Prolegomenon to the Principles of Punishment", in Punishment and Responsibility: Essays in the Philosophy of Law (1968) 7

(b) Utilitarian Theories 23

Igor Primoratz, Justifying Legal Punishment (1990) 23

C.L. Ten, Crime, Guilt and Punishment (1987) 33

C.S. Lewis, "The Humanitarian Theory of Punishment" (1953), 6 Res Judicatae 224 42

Nigel Walker, Why Punish? (1991) 47

(c) Retributive Theories 72

J. Braithwaite & P. Pettit, Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice (1990) 72

Nigel Walker, Why Punish? (1990) 76

C.L. Ten, Crime, Guilt and Punishment (1987) 88

J. Braithwaite & P. Pettit, Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice (1990) 100

Andrew von Hirsch, Past and Future Crimes: Deservedness and Dangerousness in the Sentencing of Criminals (1985) 111

Andrew Ashworth, "Criminal Justice and Deserved Sentences", [1989] Crim. L.R. 341 115

(d) Compromise or Hybrid Theories 121

Nigel Walker, Why Punish? 121

Andrew Ashworth, "Criminal Justice and Deserved Sentences", [1989] Crim. L.R. 341 131

Further Reading 132

2. The Judicial Aims and Methodology of Sentencing 133

Regina v. Willaert (1953), 105 C.C.C. 172 (Ont. C.A.) 134

Regina v. Wilmot, [1967] 1 C.C.C. 172 (Ont. C.A.) 136

Regina v. Simmons, Allen and Bezzo (1973), 13 C.C.C. (2d) 65 (Ont. C.A.) 142

Regina v. Preston (1990), 79 C.R. (3d) 61 (B.C.C.A.) 145

Colbert v. A.G. Canada (1981), 24 C.R. (3d) 77 (Que. C.A.) 150

Regina v. Inwood (1989), 69 C.R. (3d) 181 (Ont. C.A.) 155

Regina v. Lawrence (1987), 58 C.R. (3d) 71 (Ont. H.C.) 159

David Cole & Allan Manson, Release From Imprisonment: The Law of Sentencing, Parole and Judicial Review (1990) 163

Regina v. Johnas et al. (1982), 32 C.R. (3d) 1 (Alta. C.A.) 164

Regina v. Sandercock (1985), 22 C.C.C. (3d) 79 (Alta. C.A.) 170

Regina v. Naqitarvik (1986), 26 C.C.C. (3d) 193 (N.W.T.C.A.) 176

Regina v. B. (1990), 36 O.A.C. 307 (Ont. C.A.) 180

Regina v. Sweeney (!992), 11 C.R. (4th) 1 (B.C.C.A.) 183

The Canadian Sentencing Commission, Sentencing Reform: A Canadian Approach (1987) 192

An Act to Amend the Criminal Code (Sentencing), Bill C-90 (1992) 198

3. Factors Affecting Sentence: Mitigation and Aggravation 199

N. D. Walker, Sentencing: Theory, Law and Practice (1987) 199

Further Reading 207

4. The Procedural Aspects of the Sentencing Process 208

(a) Introduction 208

Jack Watson, "Guilty Pleas" (1990), 33 C.L.Q. 163 209

(b) The Factual Basis in Sentencing: The Question of Proof 215

Regina v. Gardner (1982), 30 C.R. (3d) 289 (S.C.C.) 215

Regina v. Poorman (1991), 6 C.R. (4th) 364 (Sask. C.A.) 220

Regina v. Brown (1991), 6 C.R. (4th) 334 (S.C.C.) 225

Regina v. Lawrence (1987), 58 C.R. (3d) 71 (Ont. H.C.) 228

R.J. Delisle, Annotation to Regina v. Lawrence (1987), 58 C.R. (3d) 71 (Ont. H.C.) 231

Regina v. Petrovic (1984), 13 C.C.C. (3d) 416 (Ont. C.A.) 232

(c) The Offender's Participation in the Process 235

Regina v. Schofield (1976), 36 C.R.N.S. 135 (N.B.C.A.) 235

Regina v. Dennison (1990), 80 C.R. (3d) 78 (N.B.C.A.) 237

Regina v. Dobec, [1963] 2 C.C.C. 87 (B.C.C.A.) 241

Regina v. Rudyk (1975), 1 C.R. (3d) S-26 (N.C.C.A.) 244

Regina v. Arsenault (1981), 21 C.R. (3d) 269 (P.E.I. S.C.) 248

Regina v. Urbanovich and Brown (1985), 19 C.C.C. (3d) 43 (Man. C.A.) 249

(d) The Victim's Participation in the Process 253

Edna Erez, "Victim Participation in Sentencing: Rhetoric and Reality" (1990), 18 Journal of Criminal Justice 19 253

Re Regina v. Antler (1982), 29 C.R. (3d) 283 (B.C.S.C.) 264

Regina v. Robinson (1983), 38 C.R. (3d) 255 (Ont. H.C.) 265

Criminal Code, s.735 267

Regina v. Curtis (1992), 69 C.C.C. (3d) 385 (N.B.C.A.) 268

Regina v. Swietlinski (1992), 73 C.C.C. (3d) 376 (Ont. Ct. (G.D.)) 273

(e) Reform Strategies 276

An Act to Amend the Criminal Code (Sentencing), Bill C-90 (1992) 276

Regina v. Moses (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yukon Terr. Ct.) 280

Further Reading 290